Machine Creativity: Artificial Intelligence Challenges to Copyright Law

The 10th Hong Kong IP Seminar
Intellectual Capital and Intangibles in an Innovation Century

Jyh-An Lee
The Chinese University of Hong Kong
August 3, 2018
✓ Introduction

• AI Creation
• Copyright Protection of AI Work
• Policy Consideration
• Conclusion
Introduction

• The term artificial intelligence (AI) was coined in 1950s, referring to machines that could perform tasks that required intelligence when performed by humans.

• AI has been increasingly important because of the advancement of digital and computing technologies as well as data science.
Artificial Intelligence (AI) Revenues in China, 2014-2018
billions of Chinese yuan renminbi and % change

• Introduction

✓ AI Creation

• Copyright Protection of AI Work
• Policy Consideration
• Conclusion
AI Creation

- Ray Kurzweil’s Cybernetic Poet (RKCP): a computer poet designed by the American futurist Ray Kurzweil.
- RKCP can read and analyze poems by an author and produce poetry with similar language style, patterns, and organization.
AI Creation

• Google’s AI Projects

there is no one else in the world. they were the only ones who mattered. he had to be with me. she had to be with him. i had to do this. i wanted to kill him. i started to cry. i turned to him.
小冰師從於1920年以來519位中國現代詩人，經過對幾千首詩10000次的學習，獲得了現代詩的創造力。
AI Creation

• Google’s WaveNet project produces piano compositions when given a set of classic music to analyze.
The Next Rembrandt

After studying the brushstrokes, coloration, motifs, patterns, and other aesthetic elements in Rembrandt’s works, an intelligence machine in Netherland produced a portrait.
Works Facilitated by Computers

• **Computer-assisted work**
  – Human beings use some tools to facilitate or improve their works
  – Just like pen-assisted, camera-assisted work

• **Computer-generated work**
  – After the programming activities, the role played by human in the creation of the work is negligible
  – Works are created in total absence of any human intervention at the time of the creation of the work.
Works Facilitated by Computers

• **Computer-assisted work**
  – Human beings use some tools to facilitate or improve their works
  – Just like pen-assisted, camera-assisted work

• **Computer-generated work**
  – After the programming activities, the role played by human in the creation of the works is negligible
  – Works are created in total absence of any human intervention at the time of the creation of the work.
• Introduction
• AI Creation
✓ Copyright Protection of AI Work
• Policy Consideration
• Conclusion
Originality

• Independent Creation
  – The work was not copied from elsewhere

• Minimum Degree of Human Creativity
  – Exercise of the author’s skill and/or judgment
  – Civil law jurisdictions: reflection of personality
Engineering Test to Determine AI

WHAT IS A.I.?
Turing Test

- Developed by Alan Turing, an English computer scientist, mathematician, logician, cryptanalyst, philosopher, and theoretical biologist
- “Computing Machinery and Intelligence”
  - *Can Machines Think?*
- Turing Test: *A machine is intelligent if it is able to think*
Lovelace Test

- Lady Ada Lovelace (1843), an English mathematician considered the world’s first computer programmer
  - A machine could not have human-like intelligence as long as it only did what humans intentionally programmed it to do.
  - A machine must be able to create original ideas if it is to be considered “intelligent”.
- Lovelace Test (2010)
  - A machine can pass this test if it can produce an outcome that its designer cannot explain based on their original code.
Copyright Protection

• Should copyright protect AI work when AI makes its own creative decisions independent from human input?

• Is AI work original?
No Protection

  – “To qualify as a work of ‘authorship’ a work must be created by a human being...Works that do not satisfy this requirement are not copyrightable.”
  – “the Office will not register works produced by a machine...that operates...automatically without any creative input or intervention from a human author.”
No Production

  – examples for uncopyrightable works
    • Medical imaging produced by x-rays, ultrasounds, magnetic resonance imaging, or other diagnostic equipment”
    • A claim based on a mechanical weaving process that randomly produces irregular shapes in the fabric without any discernible pattern.”
No Protection

• Preamble to the Copyright Term Directive 93/98:
  – Original work is the “author’s own intellectual creation reflecting his personality”

  – A copyright work reflect the author’s “personality and express his free and creative choices in the production of that photograph”
Protection

  – s.178: a computer-generated work
    • “generated by computer in circumstances such that there is no human author of the work”
  – s.9(3): “In the case of a literary, dramatic, musical or artistic work which is computer-generated, the author shall be taken to be the person by whom the arrangements necessary for the creation of the work are undertaken.”
Protection

  - s.12(3): period of 50 years from the end of the calendar year in which the work was made
  - s.79 & s.81: exemption from moral rights
  - William Cornish et al:
    - Neighbouring right approach
    - conflicting with EU’s “intellectual creation” standard (2013)
Protection

• Issues regarding copyright ownership: who is “the person by whom the arrangements necessary for the creation of the work are undertaken”?
  – AI Programmers? Users?
  – *Nova Productions v Mazooma Games*

• Computer-generated work: Graphics and frames shown on the screen when playing a computer game
Protection

- Jacob LJ
  - The programmer “is the person by whom the arrangements necessary for the creation of the works were undertaken and therefore is deemed to be the author by virtue of s.9(3)”
  - The player’s “input is not artistic in nature and he has contributed no skill or labour of an artistic kind. Nor has he undertaken any arrangements necessary for the creation of the frame images. All he has done is to play the game.”
  - Standard: who “contributed skill or labour of an artistic kind”?
Protection

• Copyright regimes following CPDA with “computer-generated content” provisions

  – Australia, Ireland, New Zealand, India, Hong Kong, South Africa
• Introduction
• AI Creation
• Copyright Protection of AI Work

✓ Policy Consideration
• Conclusion
• Incentive
• Incentive

• Authorship
  – Personal nature of the originality
  – Rethinking “computer-generated content”
    • Still consider the human nature of the creation: necessary arrangement
    • May be much more complicated
      – A work created by an AI, which was written by another AI
      – A work resulting from the collaboration of AI and human beings
• Incentive
• Authorship
  – Personal nature of the originality
• Favoring programmers over artists?
• Incentive
• Authorship
  – Personal nature of the originality
• Favoring programmers over artists?
• Use of Technology in Creation
Use of Technology in Creation

• *Burrow-Giles Lithographic Co. v. Sarony,* 111 U.S. 53 (1884)
  
  – Defendant Burrow-Giles argued that a photograph is not a writing nor “the production of an author”
  
  – Supreme Court: there was “original mental conception...[in] posting...Oscar Wild in front of the camera, selecting and arranging the custome, draperies...arranging the subject so as to present graceful outlines, arranging and disposing the light and shade...”
• **Nova Productions v Mazooma Games** [2007] EWCA Civ 219; [2007] Bus. L.R. 1032
  – Copyright owned by programmers but not game players?
  – Users/licensees of AI to create
• Incentive
• Authorship
  – Personal nature of the originality
• Favoring programmers over artists?
• Use of Technology in Creation
• Other ways to encourage AI development?
Copyright Exception

• Text and Data Mining of Copyright Works
  – Japan Copyright Law (Art. 47)
  – German Copyright Law (Sec. 60d)
• Introduction
• AI Creation
• Copyright Protection of AI Work
• Policy Consideration

✓ Conclusion
• The degree of human control and creative decision made by human
• The degree of AI’s independence in creative activities
• Grey area in between
THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION